Food for the Soul: The Rabbis' Cinnamon

Susan Weingarten

Abstract: Spices appear to have been used in earlier times for smelling, rather than eating. Jewish rabbinic sources from late antiquity to the present refer back to the Bible as well as relating to their own contemporary situation. They can thus be used, together with classical sources, as a way of tracing the journey of spices from fragrance to food. Cinnamon is taken as a paradigmatic example.

Andrew Dalby's excellent book *Siren Feasts: A History of Food and Gastronomy in Greece* suggests that in the ancient Greek world 'spices were not used predominately for food' but to make perfumes, perfumed oils, medicines, and aromatic wines and only later and less ubiquitously, to flavour food. Ancient Jewish sources confirm Dalby's impression for other parts of the ancient Mediterranean world: in the Bible, spices are smelled not eaten. When and how did this change? Dalby notes an increasing use of spices in Roman times mentioned in the pages of Athenaeus and the Apicius collection. From here their use in food escalates leading to the massive use of spices in Europe in the Middle Ages, with world-wide trading and even wars over these desirable commodities.

This paper looks at Jewish sources written by the rabbis of Late Antiquity and the Middle Ages in order to trace some parts of the journey of spices from fragrance to food. Scholars have already noted some of these developments, but I bring new material and interpretations in the light of rabbinical sources.[1] I take one particular spice, cinnamon, as a paradigm.

Cinnamon is a fragrant spice made from quills, dry rolled-up pieces of the inner bark of the tree *Cinnamomum zeylonicum* growing in Ceylon, today's Sri Lanka.[2] It seems to have been traded to ancient Palestine from very early times: most scholars accept the identification of biblical Hebrew *qinamon* with what we call 'cinnamon' today. [3] *Cinnamomum zeylonicum* is often confused with cassia, *Cinnamomum cassia,* although there are two different words for them in Hebrew which appear separately in various lists of spices. Hebrew *qetzia* (or *qida*) has been proposed as the origin of the word 'cassia.' The quills sold today as 'cinnamon' are usually cassia in practice, and it is often unclear to which plant ancient sources are referring. Later Jewish sources are even more confused, as they bring Biblical *qaneh*, translated as *calamus*, 'sweet reed' or 'cane' into the equation. This appears to be another scroll-like aromatic, whose name reminded the European rabbis of *canelle*, the French for cinnamon, although, as with cassia, all these terms are cited in the Bible as separate entities. There was also a spice named *qilufa*, literally 'stripped,' which was taken by

Draft Version: Not for Distribution or Citation

some rabbis as the stripped bark of cinnamon and/or cassia. Four of these terms appear separately in one list, together with other spices, while cinnamon as such is sometimes referred to as *qinamon bosem*, where *bosem* refers to the word for spice or perfume. Was this a fifth (or sixth) sort? I do not propose a solution, but note that whereas ten different kinds of cinnamon are described by the Swiss scholar Johann Scheuchzer in his eighteenth-century *Physica sacra*, modern botany identifies 275 species.[4] Scheuchzer provides images of his identification of cinnamon and calamus from Exodus (Figure 1).

FIGURE 1. Cinnamon and calamus, from J. Scheuchzer, *Physica Sacra* (1731).

The traditions of rabbinic cinnamon begin with the Hebrew Bible, where cinnamon appears three times: in Exodus, Proverbs and the Song of Songs. In Exodus 30.23 it is one of the ingredients of the perfumed oil used to anoint the High Priest himself: one of the 'chief spices' along with myrrh, sweet calamus and cassia, in a base of olive oil.

> Take … the principal spices: of pure myrrh five hundred shekels and of sweet cinnamon half so much even two hundred and fifty shekels and of sweet calamus two hundred and fifty shekels. And of cassia five hundred shekels … and of olive oil a hin. And thou shalt make it an oil of holy ointment

This concoction is so holy that it is forbidden to make it other than for a holy purpose – anointing the High Priest, the Tabernacle or a God-appointed King. Anyone who does it for another purpose, say the talmudic rabbis commenting on this, will be cut off from their people.[5]

Draft Version: Not for Distribution or Citation

In contrast, in Proverbs 7.17, cinnamon, myrrh and aloes perfume the bed of the harlot who lies in wait at the corner for the young man devoid of understanding who goes after her 'as the ox goeth to the slaughter.' In contradistinction to the holiness of the first use, we now have a totally profane use for the spice, as an aphrodisiac in adulterous sex.

In the Song of Songs 4.14, cinnamon is also used in the context of making love, but here it is not adulterous, but merely erotic. The rabbis had few problems with the erotic in the proper context. When it came to the debate as to whether to accept the erotic poem that is the Song of Songs into the canon of the Bible, Rabbi Aqiva declared: All the writings are holy but the Song of Songs is the Holy of Holies.[6] Songs' lover and his beloved were allegorised by the rabbis as God and his beloved Israel. Later, Christian exegetes would see them as Jesus and his church.[7] The girl is a locked garden to which the lover is invited, in which we find spikenard and saffron, calamus and cinnamon, frankincense, myrrh and aloes, with all the chief spices. She is compared in the next verse to an orchard, *pardes*, the beginning of the links between spices and paradise in Jewish traditions.

Thus biblical cinnamon belongs to the whole spectrum of the sacred and the profane: it is an ingredient of the oil used to anoint the High Priest in the Tabernacle, and perfumes the bed of the lovers, traditionally king Solomon and one of his many wives, but allegorised by the rabbis as God himself with his bride the people of Israel. But Solomon is also credited with writing the book of Proverbs, and here cinnamon perfumes the bed of the harlot who lies in wait for the young man devoid of understanding.

So far we have concentrated on cinnamon as an aromatic, for these are the sources the rabbis continually refer back to, to give themselves the authority of the biblical text. There is no evidence of anyone actually eating cinnamon in the texts from Songs or Proverbs: it seems to have been used simply to perfume the woman - or the bed. But slowly we find hints of gastronomic uses creeping in.

The first hint of this, appropriately perhaps, is in the Apocrypha, those texts not accepted into the canon of the Hebrew Bible but referring to many of its protagonists. The book of Ecclesiasticus, the Wisdom of Ben Sirah, was long preserved only in Greek but the Hebrew original turned up recently in the Dead Sea Scrolls. Here we find Wisdom herself perfumed with cinnamon and other spices - but also tasting sweeter than honey.[8] We will see other uses of cinnamon in the Pseudepigrapha later.

In the later midrashic literature, there seems to be a further reference to cinnamon with sexual connotations. The patriarch Abraham is compared to a cinnamon tree which grows better the more it is stripped and fertilised. This is in the context of his begetting a child at the age of a hundred on his ninety-year-old wife, after he had long lost sexual interest or potency. His potency, the midrash implies, was restored to him by his circumcision, like the stripping or pruning of the cinnamon tree. Cinnamon trees do indeed continue to be productive for fifty or more years, and this midrash seems to hint at aphrodisiac

Draft Version: Not for Distribution or Citation

FIGURE 2. Synagogue mosaic, Hammat Tiberias. The square incense shovels with red coals appear twice, to the right of each candlestick.[40]

connotations.[9] However it is totally unclear whether such an aphrodisiac was smelled, eaten or applied externally.

To return to the incense. The cinnamon and other spices which make up the priests' anointing oil are part of a recipe, which gives quantities. The rabbis of the Talmuds discuss this recipe, and add a further recipe for the incense used in the Temple (as opposed to the Tabernacle) along with instructions of what not to include, and a ban on trying to reproduce the Temple incense after the Temple was destroyed: this too was liable to the death penalty.[10] Synagogue mosaics contemporary with the Jerusalem Talmud include what appear to be representations of incense shovels (see Figure 2).

Does this mean that incense was used in the late antique synagogue in spite of the ban? Incense was used at the conclusion of *symposia* in both Greek and Jewish contexts, together with scented water to wash hands. There seems to be no strong evidence for its use in synagogues however,[11] and it is possible that the shovels are just depicted in the mosaics in memory of the incense in the Temple.

Following the details of the anointing oil in the book of Exodus, we are given details of the spices to be compounded into the incense for the Tabernacle. There are only four of

Draft Version: Not for Distribution or Citation

these, and they do not include cinnamon: *nataf, shahelet, helbona* and pure *levona*, translated as *stacte*/balm, onycha, galbanum and pure frankincense, although *nataf/stacte* has been translated as 'oil of cinnamon.'[12] It is very unclear indeed what these words represent in Hebrew, Greek, English or any other language. The terms used in Exodus differ slightly from those in the Talmud. One of these is explained: balm/*tzori*, we are told, is called *nataf* in the Bible because it was a dripping (*n-t-f*) resin. The second in the list in Exodus is *shahelet*, while the Talmuds have *tsipporen*. What the connection (if any) between *shahelet* and *tzipporen* was, is unclear. *Shahelet* is translated in the Septuagint as *onycha*, the *operculum* of a sea snail, the shiny, hard, whiteish substance the snail uses to close itself in against attackers, which looked like a fingernail. Would this product of a non-kosher snail have been used in the holy oil, even though it was not for eating? Or is this why the talmudic text changes it for *tsipporen*, a word used both for fingernails and cloves, without explanation? Dalby has concluded that cloves as we know them, which grow in the distant Molucca islands, actually got to the Roman world, including ancient Palestine, around the turn of the first century CE.[13] The fact that the origin of many spices was so unclear may have been why it took so long for them to be used in Jewish cooking, as opposed just for smelling.

The first-century Jewish philosopher Philo gives the four spices of the incense cosmic significance: they symbolise for him the four elements thought to have made up the world: earth, air, fire and water.[14] Philo lived in Alexandria and he is relating to the biblical prescription for spices for the Tabernacle, not necessarily to the actual spices used in the Jerusalem Temple which had long taken the place of the Tabernacle in the wilderness. These four spices, however, were clearly no longer enough, or perhaps there were supply problems. Josephus, the first-century Jewish historian, Philo's contemporary, who was once a priest serving in the Temple himself, tells us that he knew of thirteen spices, and notes their significance. They come, he says 'from sea and from land, both desert and inhabited,' and signify that 'all things are of God and for God.'[15] Josephus does not specify which spices he is talking about (does the reference to 'sea' hint at the *onycha/operculum*? Or is he referring to trade routes?) but it is possible that the memory is preserved in a passage quoted in both Talmuds which gives details of the spices. The list begins with the biblical spices from the Tabernacle and then adds more. It is a little difficult to decide which of the ingredients make up the thirteen, (some rabbis counted eleven or twelve) but this time they do include cinnamon and cassia, as well as *qaneh* and *qilufa*:

> Our Rabbis have taught: The compound of incense consisted of balm/*tsori*, *tsipporen*, galbanum and frankincense, each in the quantity of seventy manehs; of myrrh, cassia, spikenard and saffron, each sixteen manehs by weight; of costus twelve, of aromatic bark three, and of cinnamon nine manehs; of lye of Karsina nine qabs; of Cyprus wine three se'ahs and three qabs, though if Cyprus wine is not available, old white wine may be used instead; of salt

Draft Version: Not for Distribution or Citation

> of Sodom the fourth of a qab, and a minute quantity of a herb that caused the smoke to ascend straight upwards/*ma'aleh 'ashan*. R.Nathan says: Also a minute quantity of amber from the Jordan. If, however, honey is added, the incense is rendered unfit; while if one omits one of the ingredients, he is liable to the death penalty. R.Simeon ben Gamaliel said: Balm is nothing but a resin which exudes from the wood of the balsam-tree; the lye of Karsina was rubbed over the *tsipporen* in order to render it beautiful, and the *tsipporen* was steeped in the Cyprus wine to make it more pungent.[16]

The Jerusalem Talmud adds a comment attributed to the spice grinders of Jerusalem: if they had added honey the whole world would not have been able to withstand the smell…

This text forms part of the Sabbath liturgy to this day, bringing a virtual memory of the Temple incense, including cinnamon, into the synagogue.[17] There is evidence from the rabbinic kabbalists of the Zohar in the sixteenth century that this passage was also read aloud at other times as a prophylactic against plague, recalling the incident in Numbers 16.46-48,[18] when incense marked the arrest of the plague in the wilderness. It has not proved noticeably effective against Corona in 2020.

To return specifically to our cinnamon. Classical authors have a wonderful hoard of stories, rumours and pure inventions about cinnamon. Herodotus, the 'father of lies,' as he was known in the ancient world, is the best:

> The process of collecting the cinnamon is even stranger, in what country it grows is quite unknown, the Arabians say that the dry sticks, which we call *kinamomon,* are brought to Arabia by large birds, which carry them to their nests, made of mud, on mountain precipices which no man can climb. The method invented to get the cinnamon sticks is this: People cut up the bodies of dead oxen into very large joints, and leave them on the ground near the nests. They then scatter, and the birds fly down and carry off the meat to their nests, which are too weak to bear the weight and fall to the ground. Then men come and pick up the cinnamon. Acquired this way it is exported to other countries.[19]

Pliny writing in Rome in the first century CE rejects this story, but supplies another:

> Those old tales were invented by the Arabians to raise the price of their goods. There is an accompanying story that under the reflected rays of the sun at midday an indescribable sort of collective odour is given off from the whole of the peninsula, which is due to the harmoniously blended exhalation of all these aromas, and that the first news of Arabia received by the fleets of Alexander the Great were these odours, wafted far out to sea.
>
> All these stories are nonsense…[20]

Draft Version: Not for Distribution or Citation

Pliny then produces an account of bringing the cinnamon over vast oceans, but he (or his informers) so garbles his geographical terms that it took a long time before people understood the true origins of cinnamon in Sri Lanka and southern India.[21] But what is of interest to us here is the story of the fragrance of cinnamon over the whole of the Arabian peninsula, wafting to the fleets of Alexander. For there was a parallel story told by the authors of the talmudic sources.[22] They described the smell of the cinnamon growing around Jerusalem as filling the whole of the Land of Israel. Cinnamon, they wrote, was so common that goats (or camels) fed on it, and the sticks were used for fuel for the altars of the Temple. After the destruction of the Temple this ceased, and there is now only a tiny barleycorn of cinnamon left in the treasury of Queen Tsimtsemai.[23] Other stories of Alexander the Great appear in the talmudic literature, and elsewhere, part of the traditions now called the Alexander Romance, so it is not surprising that the story of the Land of Cinnamon identified by its smell should be shared between Greeks and Jews. But whereas for the Greeks the exoticism of the cinnamon was a function of distance in space from the faraway land of Arabia, the Jewish sources imported the spice to the God-given Land of Israel, where anything was possible for the Almighty, including the growing of exotic plants. Here cinnamon is remote in time, rather than space: the late antique rabbis placed it hundreds of years earlier, in the time when God's Temple still stood, when all must have been right with the world.[24]

Other points of meeting between Greek and Jewish worlds over cinnamon come in the legends of the phoenix, the mythical bird which dies on a funeral pyre she builds herself, and is resurrected. The phoenix built her nest with sticks of the spice, as related both by Herodotus and the early Jewish Pseudepigrapha.[25] In neither of these early traditions is cinnamon actually eaten: the Greek phoenix builds her nest with the sticks, while the Jewish phoenix (which eats manna from heaven and dew from earth) uses the spice in her funeral pyre. Spices were commonly used around the dead in antiquity, to disguise the smell of decay. [26]

We have already noted the associations of cinnamon and other spices with the orchard paradise in the Song of Songs. The rabbis of late antiquity develop this association in a number of suggestive midrashim: when Adam was expelled from Eden and his return barred by an angel with a fiery sword, he wept, and the angel let him back for a brief time. He brought out seeds, to plant and feed himself, and spices, to feed his soul. Rabbis commenting on the last verse of the book of Psalms: 'Let every soul praise God,' asked what does the soul enjoy that the body doesn't?, the answer being: smell. [27] Food in general was to feed the body; fragrances like cinnamon were food for the soul.

Another oft repeated legend tells of Noah's dove, sent to find dry land as the flood receded, which entered Eden.

> 'Why did you bring back an olive branch?' people asked her, 'Why not sweet spices like cinnamon or balsam?' 'Better the bitterness which comes from God,' replied the dove, 'than sweetness from any other source.'

Draft Version: Not for Distribution or Citation

Spices, then, originate in Eden, but we are not told how they reached our mundane world. Today, at the conclusion of the Sabbath, the second soul, which accompanies the Jew on the day of rest that is a foretaste of the World to Come, departs, but the departure is made tolerable by smelling spices, including cinnamon.[28]

So how did cinnamon become a food, rather than just a fragrance? The Greeks, according to Theophrastus, used it as a spice for wine: he was convinced that spices improved wine, but ruined food.[29] I have not found any record of this use in Jewish sources, where pepper is the preferred spice for wine.[30] We noted the problems of the use of *operculum* above, which may have led to its substitution by cloves because of its animal origin. There are also rabbinic discussions of musk in the Middle Ages, describing it as congealed blood of a deer.[31] Deer are kosher animals, but blood is forbidden in Judaism. Maybe the slow take-up by Jews of the practice of using spices in food is partly due to worries about the animal origins of some spices.

Unlike the dubious musk and *operculum*, however, cinnamon actually looked like a bit of wood or bark, and some rabbis specified that its blessing was that used for fragrances from trees.[32] Whatever the reason, it is clear that it was used from talmudic times for chewing, if not for eating. This identifiable stage on the way from fragrance to food, was paradoxically due to the definition of cinnamon as a non-food. Eating and drinking were forbidden on Jewish fast-days, but the rabbis of the Near East were aware of the misery of a dry mouth during a fast. So they allowed people to chew dry pungent stuff to encourage the production of saliva: you could chew cinnamon as long as you spat it out afterwards! However on the Day of Atonement, this was forbidden, just in case you ingested some of the cinnamon by mistake: chewing and spitting out cinnamon was only permitted on minor, not major fast-days. Dalby notes that Indians and Chinese chewed cinnamon and other spices to sweeten the breath.[33] This may also have been a factor encouraging people to chew spices when fasting, when the breath may smell bad due to dehydration.

This in-between status of cinnamon as something not quite edible was underlined by the discussions as to what blessing was to be said over it.

> Our Rabbis have taught: It is forbidden to a man to enjoy anything of this world without a benediction, and if anyone enjoys anything of this world without a benediction, he commits sacrilege [34]

The rabbis of the third-century Mishnah record blessings praising God for different kinds of foods, which were categorised according to their origin.[35] For the fruit of the tree, one should say: 'Blessed are You, O Lord our God, King of the Universe, who creates the fruit of the tree' (although wine had its own special blessing). For produce of earth you said: '... who creates the produce of the ground' (but bread had its own blessing). On vegetables the blessing was '...who creates fruit of the ground,' although Rabbi Judah preferred 'who

Draft Version: Not for Distribution or Citation

creates kinds of herbs.' There was a general blessing for other foods, such as milk or cheese or eggs. Rabbi Judah said that no blessings were to be made over bad things, such as locusts. By the time of the Jerusalem Talmud, categorised blessings were added for fragrances: …'who creates fragrant trees,' 'who creates fragrant herbs,' 'who creates sweet-smelling oil,' 'who gives a good smell to fruit' (this was said over especially fragrant fruit: citrons and quinces, and later over nutmeg) and a general 'who creates different kinds of fragrances.'

Later rabbis debated which of these blessings to apply to cinnamon. Should it be 'fragrant trees,' as it is obviously not a herb? Should they give up categorising and use the all-inclusive 'different kinds of fragrances'? Did it make a difference when a spice was so strong-smelling that it did not need to be heated before its fragrance spread? These discussions continue into the Middle Ages, when we have the first rabbinical evidence of use of cinnamon as food. Among non-Jewish contemporaries in Europe, cinnamon was by now immensely popular, in, for example, cameline sauce, which stars in the fourteenth-century *Viandier*, so-called after its camel-colour given to it by the ground cinnamon which was its main ingredient.[36]

This extensive mediaeval European use of cinnamon was problematic for the rabbis. We saw that the Talmud noted that after the Temple was destroyed only a tiny piece remained in the Queen's treasury – so how, they asked, could it be so common in contemporary Europe? They concluded that there must be problems of identification. *Canelle*, the French for cinnamon, could not possibly be referring to the same spice as the Talmud, according to R Moses of Courcy in thirteenth-century France.[37] There are many discussions of terminology and identifications, often in Arabic and much garbled, which will not concern us here.

But the discussions of which blessing to say do show us that smelling cinnamon was predominantly giving way to chewing it (like pepper, cloves and even liquorice) on fast days; to sweeten the breath; and against toothache.

A new use of cinnamon by Jews in mediaeval and later Europe was in the Passover food *haroset*. *Haroset* was a dip in memory of the clay from which the Israelite slaves made bricks in Egypt. Wicked Pharaoh had given them straw for the bricks at first, but later demanded they supply it themselves.[38] The mixture represented the clay for the bricks, and spices in it represented the straw. Some rabbis specified that the spices in memory of straw should appear as long stringy bits – so cinnamon came in. [39]

Perhaps because of *haroset*, cinnamon became more generally used in food, as we see from the discussions of the blessings. Although it came from a tree, it was not a fruit, and was thus subject to the food blessing 'who creates the produce of the earth,' usually categorised together with sugar-cane and dry ginger. By the sixteenth century, food use was clearly well established, although there were still discussions of which blessing to say. Rabbi Mordekhai Yaffe of Prague writes that the blessing should be 'who gives a good smell to fruit,' and adds the telling comment: 'because its most important use is not just to smell, but also to eat.'

Draft Version: Not for Distribution or Citation

Finally, in the nineteenth century, Rabbi Yehiel Mikhl Epstein in Lithuania actually gives us a recipe! He is discussing whether food made from grain or the compound used to flavour them constitute the more important element in the food eaten: thus, he tells us, with *lekakh* (spice cake) it is the flour made from the grain which takes precedence over the spices, so the cake has the blessing 'sorts of grain.' He adds that there is a food in some places called *ingberlakh*, where you fry cinnamon with walnuts and almonds. Some people add farfel (pasta pieces) to this, and it depends which is the major component: if it is spices, you bless 'creates the produce of the earth,' but if it's farfel, you bless 'sorts of grain.'

The name *ingberlakh* comes from *ingber*, ginger in Yiddish, but clearly he is reporting a local variant made with cinnamon.

Notes

1. See for example A.Dalby Dangerous Tastes: The Story of Spice (London, 2000); P.Freedman Out of the East: Spices and the Medieval Imagination (New Haven, 2009)
2. H.McGee On Food and cooking: the science and lore of the kitchen (NY, 2004)424-5
3. Analysis of small ceramic flasks from 11th-10th c BCE from Israel/Palestine has shown remains of cinnamaldehyde, a component of both cinnamon and cassia, in what seem to have been wine flasks: D.Namdar, A.Gilboa, R.Neumann, I.Finkelstein and S.Weiner, 'Cinnamaldehyde in early Iron Age Phoenician flasks raises the possibility of Levantine trade with South-East Asia.' Mediterranean Archaeology and Archaeometry, 12/3, (2013) 1-19.
4. Physica Sacra (Augsberg/Ulm, 1731). Image from Internet Archive. Scheuchzer also includes an account of the biblical burning bush; M. Zohary Plants of the Bible (Cambridge, 1982) 202.
5. BTKeritot 5a.For a convenient brief explanation of the talmudic literature, see S.Weingarten 'Nuts for the Children: The Evidence of the Talmudic Literature,' in R.Hosking (ed) Nurture: Proceedings of the Oxford Symposium on Food and Cookery 2003, (Bristol, 2004).
6. Mishnah Yadayim iii,5.
7. Freedman (above, n.1)77.
8. Ecclesiasticus 000
9. Interestingly, cassia, if not cinnamon, has been reported to restore sexual function to aging male rats: S. Kumar, 'Efficacy of Cinnamomum Cassia Blume in age-induced sexual dysfunction of rats,' Journal of Young Pharmacists; Dec 5(4): 148-1532013. PUB ONLINE 2013 DEC 9: DOI:10.1016/J.JYP.2013.11.001. Here too the research report does not specify how the cassia was 'administered' to the rats: as a smell, food, injection, or by external application
10. Above, n.5
11. Wikimedia commons: https://commons.wikimedia.org/wiki/File:Hamat_Tiberias_mosaic_P11202_Hamat_Tiberias_mosaic40_(6970428152).jpg
12. L.I.Levine The Ancient Synagogue: The First Thousand Years (New Haven/London 2005)234; 306
13. Webster's dictionary, 1913 ed.
14. Dalby (above, n.1) 50.
15. Quis rer. div. heres, 197, (40).
16. Jewish War 5.218-9.
17. JTYoma 42d; BTKeritot 11a
18. English prayerbooks censor the text. After mentioning soaking the tsipporen in wine, the talmudic source continues: 'In fact urine might well serve this purpose, but urine may not be brought within the precincts of the Temple because this is disrespectful.' Modern translators of the text clearly thought if it was disrespectful to bring urine into the Temple, it must also be disrespectful to even mention this in the synagogue, and they cut this out of the English translation, leaving it in the Hebrew text, in what Gibbon famously called 'the decent obscurity of a learned tongue' (Decline and Fall, 40,28). The reader may wonder whether urine was indeed efficacious in intensifying the smell. I have tried it on cloves (not

Draft Version: Not for Distribution or Citation

on operculum): it does work quite well. But it is clear from this, if from nothing else, that these spices here were not for eating and as such are really out of our remit.

19. Numbers 16.46-48 [RV] = 17. 12-15 in other versions.
20. Herodotos 3. 110-111. Tr.Dalby
21. NH 12.87-88 Tr.Dalby
22. Dalby (above, n.1) 38
23. BTShabbat 63a; JTPeah 20a and parallels
24. Unidentified.
25. Another talmudic legend of Alexander has him visiting King Qetzia, or the king of Qetzia: the inhabitants brought Alexander gold as food instead of bread, as they thought he must have bread already, but would want gold. But spices play no part in the story, apart from the name: qetzia is the Hebrew for cassia.
26. For the phoenix in Herodotos, the Apocalypse of Baruch and the Exagogue of Ezekiel, see R.Van den Broek The Myth of the Phoenix according to Classical and Early Christian Traditions (Leiden, 1972).
27. Cf John 19.32f
28. BTBerakhot 43b
29. On spices and Eden in the Middle Ages, see Freedman (above, n.1), especially chapter 3: The Odours of Paradise.
30. Theophrastus On odours 10
31. Konditon spiced wine is made of pepper, honey and wine: eg Pesiqta deRav Kahana 12. But note the probable evidence for cinnamon in wine at a much earlier period in Namdar et al (above n.3).
32. Rabbeinu Bahaye: Comm in Ex 30.23.
33. See discussion of classes of blessings below
34. Dalby cites E.H.Schafer 'Rosewood, dragon's blood and lac' Journal of American Oriental Society 77 (1957) 129-36. Non vidi.
35. BTBerakhot 35a
36. Mishnah Berakhot, chapter 6
37. T.Scully The Art of Cookery in the Middle Ages (Woodbridge, 1995 rep 2002)114. It could be bought ready made in c14th century Paris http://medievalcookery.com/recipes/cameline.html
38. Sefer Mitzvot Hagadol 167.
39. Exodus1.7-19.
40. See eg J.Möllin (the Maharil: Germany, c.15th) Sefer haMinhagim ed S.Spitzer (Jerusalem, 1989), who says cinnamon and cassia should be added to haroset in the form of long strips, like straw. For other references, see S.Weingarten Haroset : A Taste of Jewish History (New Milford/London, 2019).

Draft Version: Not for Distribution or Citation